Institutional Research in South African Higher Education in synergy with policy developments during the first two decades of the democratic dispensation

Jan Botha
CREST and DST/NRF Centre of Excellence in Scientometrics and Science, Technology and Innovation Policy (SciSTIP)
16 September 2014
Research Object:
The 488 programme events at SAAR Annual Forums during 1994-2013 in SA policy context

Research Problem:
What was the synergy, if any, between the papers, keynotes, panel discussions, workshops etc. at SAAIR Forums during 1994-2013 and policy development epochs in Higher Education during the first two decades of the democratic dispensation?
### SAAIR forum attendance 2010-2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>South African members</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outside SA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number of participants</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© Jan Botha, CREST and SciSTIP
# SAAIR Programme Events

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nature of contribution</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contributed papers</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrations</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Invited papers</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keynote addresses</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open forums</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panel discussions</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workshops</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table top discussions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Gender distribution of presenters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Population groups of presenters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>African</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institution Type</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public universities in South Africa</td>
<td>64.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Technikons and Universities in South Africa</td>
<td>18.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South African government and statutory bodies</td>
<td>3.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial companies in SA</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-governmental organisations in South Africa</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private higher education institutions in Botswana</td>
<td>1.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public universities in Botswana</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private higher education institutions in Botswana</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public university in Namibia</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Polytech of Namibia</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government bodies from Botswana</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universities in Tanzania</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universities in Mozambique</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private higher education institutions in Namibia</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Swaziland</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutions beyond SSA, and elsewhere in world</td>
<td>4.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>88%</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other</strong></td>
<td><strong>12%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Keynote addresses at SAAIR 1994-2013


© Jan Botha, CREST and SciSTIP
Presenters at SAAIR Forums 1993-2013

HJ Visser (24), G Barnes (12), G Steyn (12), D Bleazard (9), J Botha (9), SA Du Plessis (9), H Geyser (9), A Lourens (9), G Subotzky (9), P Van Eldik (9), EM Bitzer (8), T Lourens (8), E Sibanda (7), I Pretorius (6), C van der Merwe (6), D van Zyl (6), M Cronje (6), J Hendry (5), G Jacobs (5), H Alt (4), R Bally (4), C Boonzaaier (4), A Dandala (4), M Fourie-Malherbe (4), M Fowler (4), I McLean (4), P Minnaar (4), C Mjojo (4), AE Müller, R Searle (4), R Stumpf (4), CA van der Merwe (4)
Research mapping

Primary data

- **Empirical**
  - Surveys, experiments, ethnographical designs, participatory research, comparative studies, evaluation research
  - Discourse analysis, conversational analysis, life history
  - Secondary data analysis, modeling and simulation studies, historical studies, textual studies, content analysis

- **Non-empirical**
  - Methodological studies
  - Conceptual studies, Philosophical studies, Theory and Model building

Existing data
Research mapping

Empirical

Primary data

Surveys, experiments, ethnographical designs, participatory research, comparative studies, evaluation research

Discourse analysis, conversational analysis, life history

Secondary data analysis, modeling and simulation studies, historical studies, textual studies, content analysis

Conceptual studies, Philosophical studies, Theory and Model building

Existing data

Non-empirical

Methodological studies

© Johann Mouton, CREST
# Research design

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intent of researcher / research objective</th>
<th>Survey</th>
<th>Case Study</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
<th>Ethnographic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Correlational</strong></td>
<td>• Descriptive&lt;br&gt; • Interpretive</td>
<td>• Descriptive (narrative)&lt;br&gt; • Interpretive</td>
<td>• Evaluative&lt;br&gt; • Explanatory&lt;br&gt; • Descriptive</td>
<td>• Interpretive&lt;br&gt; • Descriptive&lt;br&gt; • Explanatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Generalization</strong></td>
<td>Generalization</td>
<td>Contextualization</td>
<td>Contextualization</td>
<td>Contextualization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discovery / Validation</strong></td>
<td>Validation (analytical surveys)&lt;br&gt; Discovery (explanatory)</td>
<td>Discovery (explanatory case studies)&lt;br&gt; Validation (critical case studies)</td>
<td>Validation (theory driven evaluations)&lt;br&gt; Discovery (goal free evaluations)</td>
<td>Discovery (grounded theory studies)&lt;br&gt; Validation (theory testing studies)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Diachronic / Synchronous</strong></td>
<td>• Synchronous (cross-sectional surveys)&lt;br&gt; • Diachronic (longitudinal surveys)</td>
<td>• Synchronous (Life histories)&lt;br&gt; • Diachronic (retroperspective case studies of organizations)</td>
<td>• Synchronous (process evaluations or impact assessments)&lt;br&gt; • Diachronic (outcome evaluations)</td>
<td>• Synchronous (life history studies)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Research design

### Research Object: The programme events at SAAR Conferences 1994-2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intent of researcher / research objective</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>Case Study</td>
<td>Evaluation</td>
<td>Ethnographic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Descriptive</td>
<td>Descriptive (narrative)</td>
<td>Evaluative</td>
<td>Interpretive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Correlational</td>
<td>Interpretive</td>
<td>Explanatory</td>
<td>Descriptive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Descriptive</td>
<td>Explanatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contextualization / Generalization</td>
<td>Generalization</td>
<td>Contextualization</td>
<td>Contextualization</td>
<td>Contextualization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discovery / Validation</td>
<td>Validation (analytical surveys)</td>
<td>Discovery (explanatory case studies)</td>
<td>Discovery (grounded theory studies)</td>
<td>Validation (theory driven evaluations)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discovery (explanatory)</td>
<td>Validation (critical case studies)</td>
<td>Validation (theory testing studies)</td>
<td>Discovery (goal free evaluations)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diachronic / Synchronic</td>
<td>Synchronic (cross-sectional surveys)</td>
<td>Synchronic (Life histories)</td>
<td>Synchronic (process evaluations or impact assessments)</td>
<td>Synchronic (life history studies)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Diachronic (longitudinal surveys)</td>
<td>Diachronic (retroperspective case studies of organizations)</td>
<td>Diachronic (outcome evaluations)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Literature survey

• References to SAAIR in scholarly/reference books
• References to SAAIR in scholarly journals
• SAAIR outputs in “grey literature”

Search conducted via the Stellenbosch University Library's subscription e-resources using channels such as published journals and monographs eg. EBSCHOhost, Scopus, Web of Science, Google scholar etc.


Literature survey

Articles in scholarly journals

- Chirikov (2013) in *Studies in Higher Education*
- Lange, L., Saavedra, F. M. & Romano, J (2013) in *New Directions for Institutional Research*
- Watson, P (2008) in *SAJHE*

Special edition of the SAJHE (2013)

- Eleven articles, including Scott, Badat, Teichler

Unpublished

- Lourens 2007 reference to conference proceedings
- ppt-slides on SAAIR’s web site, reports on HDs and files

© Jan Botha, CREST and SciSTIP
SAAIR’s outputs in “grey literature”

• **Grey Literature**
  – production, distribution, and access to multiple document types produced on all levels of government, academics, business, and organizations
  – in electronic and print formats
  – *not controlled by commercial publishing* i.e. where publishing is not the primary activity of the producing body

• **Examples**
  reports (pre-prints, preliminary progress and advanced reports, technical reports, statistical reports, memoranda, state-of-the art reports, market research reports, etc.), theses, conference proceedings, technical specifications and standards, non-commercial translations, bibliographies, technical and commercial documentation, and official documents

• **Where are SAAIR’s knowledge outputs?**
Classifying SAAIR Programme Events

- Starting point: “four areas that challenge Institutional Researchers and the institutions they serve”, strategic planning, assessment, accreditation, curriculum development (Voorhees & Hinds 2012:80)
- Further categories distinguished through a close reading and study of the titles of the SAAIR programme events
- 22 categories, grouped into 8 themes
Planning, information and implementation /management

Strategic planning at system and institutional levels 6%
Environmental scanning 4%
Institutional transformation and change (including mergers) 9%
Enrollment planning and management 3%
Performance indicators 4%
Management information and business intelligence for decision-support and reporting 10%
Subsidy, funding, fees 4%
Quality assurance

10%

Quality assurance policy and arrangements  7%

Institutional audits, program reviews and program accreditation  2%

Reviews of institutional organizational units (e.g., departments, schools, support units)  1%
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teaching &amp; learning and curriculum development</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student preparedness</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language of instruction</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interventions to enhance the quality of student learning and improve student success</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student experience and student engagement</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student satisfaction studies</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracking student success and follow-up studies</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Knowledge production by universities 4%
Community engagement 1%
Postgraduate studies 2%
International benchmarking and learning 3%
Practice and instruments of Institutional Research 16%
Practice and instruments of 16% Institutional Research

Institutional research practice 10%

Information and communication technology tools, 6% instruments and models in IR
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instruments and practice of Institutional Research</th>
<th>International benchmarking and learning</th>
<th>Postgraduate studies</th>
<th>Community engagement</th>
<th>Knowledge production by universities</th>
<th>Teaching &amp; learning and curriculum development</th>
<th>Quality assurance and evaluation</th>
<th>Planning, information and implement, management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Series1</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Classification and distribution of programme events
ALL FOUR periods (1994-2013) DETAIL in # (n=488)

- Strategic planning at system and institutional levels
- Environmental scanning
- Institutional transformation and change (including mergers)
- Enrollment planning and management
- Performance indicators
- Management information and business intelligence for decision-support
- Subsidy, funding, fees
- Quality assurance policy and arrangements
- Institutional audits, program reviews and program accreditation
- Reviews of institutional organizational units (e.g., departments, schools,
- Student preparedness
- Language of instruction
- Interventions to enhance the quality of student learning and improve
- Student experience and student engagement
- Student satisfaction studies
- Tracking student success and follow-up studies
- Knowledge production by universities (the research function)
- Community engagement
- Postgraduate studies
- International benchmarking and learning
- Institutional research practice
- Information and communication technology tools, instruments and

© Jan Botha, CREST and SciSTIP
1994-2000

- HE to match needs of a society in social, political and economic transition
- Institutional plans (1999)
- Focus on access, equity and redress
- Policy implementation lacking
Periodization of Higher Education Policy

2001-2005

- NPHE (2001) and mergers (2001-2005)
- Intense policy making and roll out of the steering mechanisms
  - new funding formula (2003)
  - planning (PQMs 2002 and mergers 2002)
  - quality assurance (accreditation and institutional audits, 2004)
- From focus on equity, access, redress and democratisation to focus on efficiency and effectiveness
Periodization of Higher Education

2006-2008

- Pandor ministry: consolidation
- New funding framework implemented
- Enrolment planning (2006)
- NQF Act 67 of 2008 and HEQ(S)F
Periodization of Higher Education

2009-2013

- Higher Education Laws Amendment Act 26 of 2010
- Transformation Oversight Committee
- Decline of CHE
- National Development Plan (NDP)
- PSET Green and White papers
- Review of subsidy formula
- Quality Enhancement Project (QEP)

© Jan Botha, CREST and SciSTIP
HE Policy Development in four periods

A 1994-2000
B 2001-2005
C 2006 – 2008
D 2008 – 2013
Classification and distribution of programme events
Period A (1994-2000) SUMMARY in %

Planning, information and implementation/management,

Quality assurance and evaluation

Teaching & learning and curriculum development

Knowledge production by universities (the research function)

Community engagement

Postgraduate studies

International benchmarking and learning

Instruments and practice of Institutional Research

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Planning, information and implementation/management</th>
<th>Quality assurance and evaluation</th>
<th>Teaching &amp; learning and curriculum development</th>
<th>Knowledge production by universities (the research function)</th>
<th>Community engagement</th>
<th>Postgraduate studies</th>
<th>International benchmarking and learning</th>
<th>Instruments and practice of Institutional Research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Instruments and practice of Institutional Research</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International benchmarking and learning</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postgraduate studies</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community engagement</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge production by universities (the research function)</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching &amp; learning and curriculum development</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality assurance and evaluation</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning, information and implementation/management</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© Jan Botha, CREST and SciSTIP
Classification and distribution of programme events
Period A (1994-2000) DETAIL in # (n=116)

- Strategic planning at system and institutional levels
- Environmental scanning
- Institutional transformation and change (including mergers)
- Enrollment planning and management
- Performance indicators
- Management information and business intelligence for decision-making
- Subsidy, funding, fees
- Quality assurance policy and arrangements
- Institutional audits, program reviews and program accreditation
- Reviews of institutional organizational units (e.g., departments, faculties, etc.)
- Student preparedness
- Language of instruction
- Interventions to enhance the quality of student learning and development
- Student experience and student engagement
- Student satisfaction studies
- Tracking student success and follow-up studies
- Knowledge production by universities (the research function)
- Community engagement
- Postgraduate studies
- International benchmarking and learning
- Institutional research practice
- Information and communication technology tools, instruments and infrastructure
Classification and distribution of programme events
Period B (2001-2005) SUMMARY in %

Planning, information and implement, management - 34%
Quality assurance and evaluation - 8%
Teaching & learning and curriculum development - 31%
Knowledge production by universities - 8%
Community engagement - 2%
Postgraduate studies - 16%
International benchmarking and learning - 2%
Instruments and practice of Institutional Research - 0%

Series1:
- Instruments and practice of Institutional Research: 16%
- International benchmarking and learning: 2%
- Postgraduate studies: 0%
- Community engagement: 2%
- Knowledge production by universities: 8%
- Teaching & learning and curriculum development: 31%
- Quality assurance and evaluation: 8%
- Planning, information and implement, management: 34%
Classification and distribution of programme events
Period B (2001-2005) DETAIL in # (n=154)

- Strategic planning at system and institutional levels
- Environmental scanning
- Institutional transformation and change (including mergers)
- Enrollment planning and management
- Performance indicators
- Management information and business intelligence for decision-making
- Subsidy, funding, fees
- Quality assurance policy and arrangements
- Institutional audits, program reviews and program accreditation
- Reviews of institutional organizational units (e.g., departments, faculties)
- Student preparedness
- Language of instruction
- Interventions to enhance the quality of student learning and teaching
- Student experience and student engagement
- Student satisfaction studies
- Tracking student success and follow-up studies
- Knowledge production by universities (the research function)
- Community engagement
- Postgraduate studies
- International benchmarking and learning
- Institutional research practice
- Information and communication technology tools, instruments and methods

© Jan Botha, CREST and SciSTIP
Classification and distribution of programme events
Period C (2006-2008) SUMMARY in %

- Planning, information and implement, management: 47%
- Quality assurance and evaluation: 15%
- Teaching & learning and curriculum development: 17%
- Knowledge production by universities: 2%
- Community engagement: 0%
- Postgraduate studies: 2%
- International benchmarking and learning: 14%
- Instruments and practice of Institutional Research: 14%

© Jan Botha, CREST and SciSTIP
Classification and distribution of programme events
Period C (2006-2008) DETAIL in # (n=57)

Strategic planning at system and institutional levels
Environmental scanning
Institutional transformation and change (including mergers)
Enrollment planning and management
Performance indicators
Management information and business intelligence for decision-support
Subsidy, funding, fees
Quality assurance policy and arrangements
Institutional audits, program reviews and program accreditation
Reviews of institutional organizational units (e.g., departments, schools,)
Student preparedness
Language of instruction
Interventions to enhance the quality of student learning and improve
Student experience and student engagement
Student satisfaction studies
Tracking student success and follow-up studies
Knowledge production by universities (the research function)
Community engagement
Postgraduate studies
International benchmarking and learning
Institutional research practice
Information and communication technology tools, instruments and

© Jan Botha, CREST and SciSTIP
Classification and distribution of programme events
Period D (2009-2013) SUMMARY in %

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Planning, information and implement, management</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality assurance and evaluation</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching &amp; learning and curriculum development</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge production by universities</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community engagement</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postgraduate studies</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International benchmarking and learning</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instruments and practice of Institutional Research</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© Jan Botha, CREST and SciSTIP
Distribution of programme events across four periods (1994-2013)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Planning, information and implement, management</th>
<th>Quality assurance and evaluation</th>
<th>Teaching &amp; learning and curriculum development</th>
<th>Knowledge production by universities</th>
<th>Community engagement</th>
<th>Postgraduate studies</th>
<th>International benchmarking and learning</th>
<th>Instruments and practice of Institutional Research</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A 1994-2000</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B 2001-2005</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C 2006-2008</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D 2009-2013</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>